

Incoming CO150025

0067

From: Dale Harber <dharber@fs.fed.us>
To: <mreynolds@etv.net>
Date: 10/20/2006 10:52:19 AM
Subject: response_draft_submittal4_10_19_06.doc

Mark:

Here are our comments to your responses. Please let me know if you have any questions.

Dale

(See attached file: response_draft_submittal4_10_19_06.doc)

CC: Karl M Boyer <kboyer@fs.fed.us>, <waynehedberg@utah.gov>, <joehefrich@utah.gov>, <stevechristensen@utah.gov>, Dale Harber <dharber@fs.fed.us>

The following are responses to Forest Service comments in the preliminary submittal #4 on the Bear Canyon Mine Plan Modification.

1. The discussion of the longwall and room-and-pillar mining seems adequate. However, we want Co-op to understand that we will probably need some additional information for preparation of the NEPA analysis for the Mine Plan Modification. To make a decision based on an EA we must have enough information to show that there would be no significant (based on the CEQ definition) impacts.
2. Same as #1.
3. OK
4. Same as #1.
5. OK
6. The FS and BLM must give prior approval to escarpment failures. Therefore, we need a map showing the proposed areas of escarpment failure. We must disclose the impacts in the EA.
7. Copies of Attachments 2 and 3 were sent to the FS by Steve Christensen of DOGM.
8. OK, but cite some references of studies that support your position. Just saying that there are "countless studies" is not good enough.
9. OK
10. OK
11. OK
12. OK
13. OK
14. OK
15. OK
16. OK
17. The Ferron-Price Ranger District is working with Mark Stilson to update FS water rights in the Gentry Mountain area. We will provide Co-op with the updated information within the next few days, as soon as we receive it from the District.

18. OK

19. Need to show the location of the Castlegate SS escarpment over the entire area. We must disclose the effects of mining over the entire area.

20. OK

21. OK

22. OK

23. OK

24. OK

25. Both the Northern goshawk and the golden eagle are Management Indicator Species. The American peregrine falcon has been delisted and is now a sensitive species. The birds on the Utah Partners in Flight list (migratory birds covered by E.O. 13186).

26. Describe the "substantial value habitat" for the species. We need to know what habitat the species need so that we can evaluate potential impacts.

27. This list is the "Utah Federally Listed Threatened, Endangered, and Candidate Species". It is also not complete. Update the list from the DWR website. For Fig. 3-1, use the title that is on the DWR website.

28. OK

29. OK

30. OK

31. OK

32. When a statement like this is made, cite a reference. Be specific so the reader can review the reference. There is currently nothing but Co-op's statement.

33. OK

34. List species. Describe which ones may be affected by escarpment failure and loss of riparian habitat.

35. OK

36. OK

37. The American peregrine falcon has been delisted and is now a sensitive species. The migratory birds on the Utah Partners in Flight list should also be discussed.

The following comment covers the "Response to Additional Comments from the Forest Service", which basically covers the PHC.

There was a misunderstanding when we started reviewing the PHC. We thought it covered only the Wildhorse Ridge addition from several issues. However, one important item came out of the review of the PHC that must still be addressed. It is necessary to have mine water discharge information to predict potential impacts to the Colorado River T&E fish species. It is also necessary if the mining will reduce the flows in Huntington Creek. Will there be additional water discharge when mining goes into areas below the potentiometric surface of the Star Point sandstone?